

ARDA B. MARVIN - RETIRED
DEAN S. EDMONDS
FRANK E. BARROWS
W. BROWN MORTON
MERTON W. SAGE
WILLIS H. TAYLOR, JR.
ERNEST H. MESCHERT
GEORGE E. MIDDLETON
MORRIS D. JACKSON
R. MORTON ADAMS
RAYMOND F. ADAMS
LESLIE B. YOUNG
DANIEL V. MAHONEY

COUNSELLORS AT LAW

165 BROADWAY

NEW YORK

WASHINGTON OFFICES
NATIONAL PRESS BUILDING

LOUIS D. FORWARD
H. STANLEY MANFIELD
GEORGE E. FAITHFULL
DONALD F. MCCARTHY
HAL E. SEAGRAVES
JOHN HOKIE
JOHN T. FARLEY
CURT VON BOETTCHER, JR.
JAMES B. CHRISTIE
JAMES W. LAIST
CYRUS S. HARPOOD
ROGER T. McLEAN
HAROLD A. TRAVER
MERTON S. NEILL
W. PETERS BLANC
FREDERICK L. BISSINGER
KENNETH B. MURRAY
CARL E. RING
W. B. MORTON, JR.

D4947

January 10, 1941

RECORDED & INDEXED
1/13/41

Mr. Frederick Laist, Vice-President
International Smelting and Refining Co.
25 Broadway (Room 1720)
New York, N. Y.

Dear Sir:

Re: Johnson et al. Application, Serial
No. 178,352, Filed December 6, 1937,
For: Method of Producing White Lead

Enclosed herewith are two copies of a Supplemental
amendment which we have just forwarded to the Patent Office
for filing to supplement the amendments made in our amend-
ment dated December 31, 1940.

Very truly yours,

James W. Laist

Enc.

Copy of letter with enclosure sent Mr. Case 1/13/41
S.

PNYC00008416

IN THE UNITED STATES PATENT OFFICE

In re application of :
GUNNARD E. JOHNSON, :
REGINALD G. BOWMAN and :
WILLIAM J. KNOX, JR., :
Serial No. 178,352 : METHOD OF PRODUCING
FILED December 6, 1937 : WHITE LEAD
Div. 56 - Room 4725 :

New York, N.Y., January 9, 1941.

Honorable Commissioner of Patents
Washington, D.C.

SUPPLEMENTAL AMENDMENT

S i r :

Supplementing the amendment dated December 31, 1940,
filed in the above-identified application, please amend the
application as follows:

Claim 2, line 11, after "bicarbonate" insert
--ion--;

Claim 4, line 11, after "bicarbonate" insert
--ion--;

Claim 5, line 5, after "bicarbonate" insert
--ion--; and
line 8, after "bicarbonate" insert
--ion--;

Claim 11, line 15, after "bicarbonate" insert
--ion--;

line 16, after "subjecting" insert
--a portion of--;

line 17, after "and" insert --by--; and
line 17, after "anolyte" insert --the
remaining portion of--.

PNYC00008417

N11214.01

R E M A R K S

Reconsideration of this application in its amended form is respectfully requested.

Applicants' solicitor wishes to acknowledge an interview courteously granted by the Examiner in charge of this application. During the interview the claims were considered in the light of the affidavit of William J. Knox, Jr. filed concurrently with the amendment dated December 31, 1940.

It appeared during the above-noted interview that the invention would be more accurately defined in claims 2, 4, 5 and 11 if it were brought out that the improvement of this invention relates to adjusting the bicarbonate ion concentration in the anolyte. Accordingly, these claims have been amended to insert the word "ion" in appropriate places in the claims.

Claim 11 has also been amended in order more fully to define the specific procedure recited therein. Thus, the claim in its present form calls for subjecting "a portion of" the catholyte to excess carbonation and adding to the anolyte "the remaining portion of" uncarbonated catholyte. This procedure is neither described nor suggested in the patent to Johnson et al or by any of the other references of record.

It is submitted that the claims in their present form clearly and patentably define over the references of record and are allowable. Each of the claims defines a control method which is not described in the Johnson et al patent or in any of the other references of record. The above-mentioned affidavit of William J. Knox, Jr. states as a matter of fact that with the methods of control represented

by procedures (2) and (4) of the Johnson et al patent the acetate ions and the sodium ions, respectively, in order to effect control of the bicarbonate ion concentration, must be added at a rate substantially in excess of the rate at which these added ions are lost during normal operation of the electrolytic cell. The fact that such building up of ions is not encountered in the control method of the present invention is also set forth in the affidavit. As a possible explanation, but not as any limitation to the invention, it is submitted that the fact that the white lead composition control is more sensitive to the addition of a small quantity of added hydroxide than it is to the addition of relatively large quantities of acid or bicarbonate may reside in the function of the added substance within the electrolyte. In the case of added acid or bicarbonate, the added substance serves the purpose of changing reaction equilibrium by the change in the concentration of the acid or bicarbonate. In the control method of the present invention the hydroxyl ions which are added stabilize the ratio of bicarbonate to hydroxyl ions which would otherwise increase during normal operation until finally only lead carbonate would be produced (see page 4 of the specification, last paragraph). Thus, in applicants' control method the added ions which control the resulting product composition are ions which enter into the final product as it is produced.

Favorable reconsideration and early allowance are respectfully requested.

Respectfully submitted,

Attorneys for Applicants