

FILE NAME: Owens Illinois (OWILL)

DATE: 1936

DOC#: OWILL002

DOCUMENT DESCRIPTION: Newspaper Articles -Silcosis

# Silicosis Committee

## Illinois Manufacturers' Association

O. E. Mount, Chairman

**S**ILICOSIS and similar diseases caused by the inhaling of dust have created such a problem for all Illinois manufacturers, involving millions of dollars in claims for damages in common-law suits, that the only remedy seems to be to include such cases in the Workmen's Compensation Act.

Several meetings of the Silicosis Committee and its sub-committee were held during the year. At a meeting on September 8, it was unanimously decided to introduce an amendment if possible at a special session of the Legislature, reading as follows:

Amend paragraph 7 of section 3 of the Compensation Act by inserting therein after the word in the second line, "vapors," the following: "silicon dioxide dust or other noxious or poisonous dusts," so that said paragraph shall read as follows:

"In any enterprise wherein molten metal, or explosive or injurious gases or vapors, silicon dioxide dust or other noxious or poisonous dusts, or inflammable vapors or fluids, or corrosive acids are manufactured, used, generated, stored or conveyed in dangerous quantities."

### New Provision

Thereafter add to section 3 a new paragraph 7½ as follows:

"Any disability to or death of an employee resulting from exposure to silicon dioxide dust or other noxious or poisonous dusts, shall constitute an accidental injury for which compensation shall be payable under this Act."

After a brief presentation of the purpose of this meeting, Dr. A. M. Harvey of the Crane Company was called upon to discuss "Silicosis and Dust Diseases from a Medical Point of View."

Silicosis and similar dust diseases, Dr. Harvey pointed out, confront Illinois and every other state. A few months ago it was estimated damage claims involving \$50,000,000 had either been tried or started. Probably double that amount at the present time confront employers. Compensation is asked of industry for certain workers who presumably are disabled, but in reality a tribute is being levied upon industry by those who are getting the tribute from the persons who claim to be injured. The money is going to smart doctors and lawyers.

"Thirty years ago," said Dr. Harvey, "it was predicted that a gradual increase of lung diseases due to occupational dust might be expected, but no one expected the growth of thousands of cases. It has been called a depression disease—the plaintiff has nothing to lose and may have something to gain.

"Silicosis and similar diseases are caused by the inhalation of microscopic particles of silica which lodge in the lungs and develop slowly—the progress of the disease depending upon the quantity inhaled and the time of exposure. Symptoms appear slowly, with shortness of breath and difficulty in breathing. The appetite is capricious,

there is weakness, more frequent colds, bronchitis, influenza and presently tuberculosis following silicosis due to irritation.

"The question ultimately must be settled on a permanent basis with a properly drafted occupational disease law. A state board to pass upon silicosis and similar diseases should be appointed, separate from the present Industrial Commission. The Illinois Industrial Commission does not want a lot of lung cases. Dust will have to be stopped at its origin as a result of more careful methods in factories. Dissemination of dust must be avoided.

"Few industries can cope with this silicosis problem and remain financially sound, even if they settle the cases. There should be physical examinations at least every six months and if the workman shows tuberculosis or healed tuberculosis, he should be put in some other occupation. I know of twenty men who are the apparent picture of health, but x-ray examinations show silicon dioxide."

Dr. Harvey recommended that those present secure the following publications for a study of the effect of dust upon certain diseases:

Report by the Industrial Commission of Wisconsin, on "Effect of Dust Upon the Respiratory System."

Report by the Industrial Commission of Wisconsin, giving general orders in connection with dust fumes, vapors and gases.

Report by a commission appointed by Governor Pinchet on occupational diseases, issued by the Pennsylvania Industrial Commission, Harrisburg.

Journal of the American Medical Association for August 19, 1933.

### Legal Aspects

A. C. Hirth of the Owens-Illinois Glass Company, talked on the "Legal Aspects of Silicosis and Other Dust Diseases."

Most cases, involving dust diseases constituted a racket, he stated, but the problem had its serious side. While many cases were fraudulent, an employer could not go into court with their fraudulent character as a basis. Many cases were bona fide. There might or might not be liability.

For 210 years there has been knowledge that certain diseases were caused by certain types of dust. The law contemplates that a workman should have a safe place in which to work. For twenty years there has been more or less knowledge of dust diseases in various countries and for fifteen years this country has been studying the effect of dust upon the respiratory system.

Mr. Hirth stated that the subject of special legislation covering dust hazards had been considered in a number of states and in several states laws relating to the hazard had been enacted. In states where such laws were not in effect, plaintiffs took their claims for damage before common law courts. This was exceedingly expensive for employers. The Pennsylvania Pulverizer case had cost \$40,000 for legal expenses, including a record of the case. A

verdict of \$10,000 against the company had afterwards been set aside by the Court of Appeals on the ground that no negligence on the part of the employer had been established, but the expense of the case had to be borne by the employer.

Mr. Hirth thought all such cases should be tried under the Workmen's Compensation Act. There was no need of a jury. The evidence should be presented to commissions, as was the practice in Canada and Great Britain. He referred to 128 cases against one employer in St. Louis, which had netted \$100,000 for one attorney. If silicosis cases were tried before a commission, it would be possible to pay the compensation in monthly installments and if the employe went back to work and showed an improved condition, the award could be cut down or discontinued.

J. L. Earlywine of the Illinois Steel Company stated that up to three or four years ago, no employer realized the danger from silicosis and other dust diseases. Twenty years ago no foundry ever had a case of silicosis. If lawyers and doctors were honest, most of the cases could be defeated, he said.

### Silicon Dioxide

Mr. Earlywine stated he had defended cases during the last two and one-half years and had reached the conclusion that silicon dioxide was the only dangerous dust. He thought it would be sufficient to amend the Act to cover such cases. Every industrial employer of Illinois was subject to such cases and must be in a position to defend himself against a racket. He referred to damages in which 50 per cent of the fees went to the lawyers and stated that if an employe obtained a judgment of \$15,000, he would be lucky if he got \$5,000 for himself after all the court costs were paid.

He referred to an unsuccessful attempt to secure an amendment to the Workmen's Compensation Act at the last session of the Illinois General Assembly, the failure being largely due to the fact that the employers were not united. The present plan was to introduce an amendment to the Workmen's Compensation Act, which would include silicon dioxide and other dust diseases, and it would be necessary to obtain an agreement with organized labor to the amendment in order to have the proposal submitted in the Governor's call for a Special Session, and also for the reason that a two-thirds vote of the Legislature was necessary to insure the passage of the proposed amendment in a special session.

David R. Clarke, counsel, talked on the importance of having the amendment included in the call for a special session and proposed that Mr. Earlywine take the matter up with representatives of labor.

W. E. Crecombe of the American Manufacturing Steel Company, stated silicosis cases involving \$20,000,000 in damages were on the court dockets in New York.

F. H. Elam of the American Steel Foundries, stated the increased cost of compensation cases in Pennsylvania covering silicosis amounted to about 8 per cent.

Commonwealth Edison Company, Chicago, has filed with the Illinois Commerce Commission a series of industrial rate changes which should interest many manufacturers in Chicago. The company's contract department is prepared to give full information.



4/23/36

ISSUES  
~~THE SILICOSIS PROBLEM~~  
THE SILICOSIS PROBLEM

Out of the National Conference on Silicosis held recently at Washington emerges the gratifying fact that even now it is possible to cope with deadly rock dust. It is good to note that the representative of labor at Washington insisted that the workers in the dusty trades are more interested in saving their lungs than in obtaining compensation for disability, and that employers would rather improve the conditions under which dust is of necessity generated than subject themselves to the harassing tactics of the ambulance-chasing type of lawyer who preys on workers and keeps for himself the greater part of the damages that he may succeed in collecting. As it is, industry is now almost without financial protection. Few liability companies will assume a silicosis risk at any but a prohibitive premium. It is a sad commentary that death from tuberculosis contracted in drilling is preferred by workers to rejection on medical grounds, or relegation to safer but less well-paid tasks by a humane employer after the X-rays have told their story of incipient silicosis.

In view of the enormous literature that has already appeared on silicosis it should be possible to frame a safety code which would be endorsed by both employers and labor. The South African gold mines have shown what can be done. In this country we have, among others, the investigations of the Public Health Service, the Bureau of Mines, the Harvard School of Public Health, the Baranac Laboratories. The good-will of the employers has been revealed by the investigations of the American Standards Committee and the Air Hygiene Foundation of America. Indeed, Mr. ALFRED C. HUGHES was able to say at Washington on behalf of the Foundation that, so far as the design and fabrication of mechanical appliances are concerned, the dust hazard "is already on the way out." This being so, there is no reason why the installation of dust-removing or dust-preventing apparatus should not be made compulsory, as even the admittedly bad bill now before the State

Legislature provides. If, in addition, State inspectors periodically made dust counts and surveyed industrial plants and excavations where dust would ordinarily be generated in dangerous amounts, there can be little doubt that silicosis would in a very few years be a rare occupational disease.

As a matter of practical legislation New York is primarily concerned with it these few years. Under a New York law which compels an employer to contribute heavily to special disability funds maintained by the Department of Taxation and Finance, whenever a worker is killed and leaves no dependents, many hundred thousand dollars have accumulated. The Industrial Commissioner himself proposed that out of these several funds \$75,000 be appropriated annually for a study of silicosis—a proposal removed by the Assembly from the pending bill. This suggests that disabled workers who can prove that they contracted tuberculosis in a silicotic industry may well be cared for out of this accumulation during the brief transition period required to install preventive machinery, in accordance with a mandatory law.



700  
148

44-100-100

WEDNESDAY, APRIL 15, 1936.

900  
148

## SILICOSIS PROBLEM IN STATE AT 'CRISIS'

*4/15/36*  
Andrews Paper, Read at Capital Parley, Cites Move to Modify Compensation Law.

### HAZARD HELD 'ON WAY OUT'

New Appliances Promising, Research Aide Says—Miss Perkins Urges Broad Plan.

Special to THE NEW YORK TIMES.

WASHINGTON, April 14.—Elmer F. Andrews, New York State Industrial Commissioner, in a memorandum placed before the national conference on silicosis, held here today upon the call of Secretary Perkins, said that an emergency situation existed in silica dust hazard industries in New York State.

The memorandum, presented by Dr. Leonard Greenburg, director of the Division of Industrial Hygiene of the New York State Department of Labor, declared that the problem of silicosis prevention has become acute for employers in recent years because of common law damage suits aggregating millions.

Under a law adopted last year in New York, Commissioner Andrews said, silicosis was made a compensable disease, but employers were subjected to "staggering insurance premiums" and the employees were also adversely affected.

"Many plants were faced with the threat of shutdowns," he went on, "which would put hundreds of skilled workers on the street and add many to the relief rolls."

In the end, he added, a bill drastically limiting compensation for silicosis was prepared, and is now before the Legislature. He said the bill was not a good one, but "we are confronted with an emergency."

"The workers want their jobs back," he added. "They are willing to forgo a portion of their compensation in order to work. Industry does not want to close its plants."

Alfred C. Birch of the Air Hygiene Foundation of America, an organization of 1,000 companies, asserted that mechanical appliances have developed "to such a degree that the existence of a dust hazard is already on its way out."

John P. Frey, president of the Metal Trades Department of the American Federation of Labor, said

that workmen who have been X-rayed and found silicotic have been discharged, only to learn that other employers were unwilling to place them on the payroll.

Where silicosis exists, he added, nobody questioned the need for X-ray examinations, but labor questioned "the justice of discharge or the payment of lower wage rates at some other occupation."

Secretary Perkins, in opening the meeting, said that silicosis exposure in some degree faces 500,000 wage-earners. She advocated a comprehensive plan for workmen's compensation in connection with silicosis and other dust diseases.

