

Chemical Leukemogenesis: Benzene as a Model

Eugene P. Cronkite

BENZENE CARCINOGENESIS IN MAN

BENZENE has been accepted as an environmental carcinogen by US regulatory agencies. It is ubiquitous, being produced by natural processes in nature and in huge amounts in industry. For example, in the US, 1.6×10^9 gallons were produced in 1980 in the petroleum industry alone.³³ In 1897, LeNoir⁴³ described a case of purpura in man, and in 1928, acute leukemia in a person exposed to benzene was reported by Delore and Borgomano.¹⁷ The evidence of benzene being a human carcinogen is based to a large extent upon the clinical studies of Aksoy et al.¹⁻⁴ and Vigliani and Saita.⁷⁰ The clinical evidence incriminating benzene is described by Aksoy et al.² Their study is summarized. In Turkey, chronic benzene poisoning occurred in workers involved in the manufacture of shoes and slippers where benzene is used as a solvent. Of 34 individuals with pancytopenia, six subsequently developed acute leukemia. Aksoy stated, "from 1967 to September 1973, 26 patients with acute leukemia or preleukemia were seen in Istanbul among 28,500 shoe workers exposed chronically to benzene. The incidence of leukemia among these workers was 13/100,000, which is a marked and statistically significant increase over that for leukemia in the general population and provides cogent evidence for the clinical impression of a leukemogenic effect of benzene in man." Aksoy,⁴ in his most recent publication, reported that leukemia in benzene-exposed workers decreased after the phase out of benzene in Istanbul, and there was no leukemia observed in workers during the last 3 years of his last study, implicating benzene as a probable causative agent in the earlier intervals. That

benzene perturbed hematopoiesis has long been known. Selling⁶⁰ and Weiskotten et al.⁷¹ in 1916 clearly demonstrated that injection of benzene produced pancytopenia in rabbits and other mammals. Evidence that benzene might be leukemogenic was first deduced from the sequence of events in human beings. It appears that after intermittent chronic exposure to inhaled benzene of the order of 200 to 300 ppm for unknown periods of time, pancytopenia may develop after a variable latent period. In those individuals that survive after variable latent periods, acute leukemia may develop. The leukemias described have been acute myelogenous leukemia, lymphoblastic leukemia, and erythroblastic leukemia. Whereas the incidence of pancytopenia in workers exposed chronically to benzene is unquestioned, whether the incidence of leukemia is significantly increased has been questioned and will be considered next. Ott et al.⁵¹ studied 594 occupationally exposed workers. Three cases of leukemia were observed when 0.8 was expected. Their statistical analysis showed $P < .047$. They concluded, "work histories and lack of medical history made a retrospective assessment of the possible relationship to benzene exposure very judgmental."

Further incrimination of benzene as a human leukemogen has been suggested by the detailed epidemiological studies of Infante et al.,³⁴ Rinsky et al.,⁵⁶ White et al.,⁷² and Infante and White.³³ In the first place, there are a large number of uncertainties in the estimation of human cancer risk because many of the important conditions with which one is concerned lie outside the range of scientific observation. Gaffey,²¹ in criticism of White et al.,⁷² points out a potential defect in all risk assessments, namely, the age-specific incidence of cancer varies with age and is increasing in most instances. The assumption that relative risk is constant for all age groups is questionable and usually false. In response, Infante et al.³⁴ point out that in reality, they used two cumulative mortalities for leukemia; one for people exposed to benzene and one for the white male population aged 20 to 84 years. The ratio of these two $\times 100$ is the standardized mortality rate (SMR). It appears that the Gaffey criticism is

From the Medical Research Center, Brookhaven National Laboratory, Upton, NY.

Supported by the US Department of Energy under contract DE-AC02-76CH00016.

Address reprint requests to Eugene P. Cronkite, MD, Medical Research Center, Brookhaven National Laboratory, Upton, NY 11973.

This is a US government work. There are no restrictions on its use.

0037-1963/87/2401-0002\$0.00/0

Seminars in Hematology, Vol 24, No 1 (January), 1987: pp 2-11

not pertinent to the Infante et al²⁴ study, but is an important consideration in epidemiologic studies. Van Raalte et al⁶⁹ observed that there is inadequate information on exposure of groups in which leukemia was present and he also questioned linearity of response with exposure. The permissible exposure or time-weighted average (TWA) imposed by the Occupational Safety and Health Administration is 10 ppm benzene averaged over an eight-hour work day. All epidemiologic estimates of the incidence of any disease in a population chronically exposed to benzene must be correlated with the exposure level. Infante and White³³ have shown that in the period 1937 to 1940, the TWA was of 150 ppm in inspired air, and from 1941 to 1946, it was 100 ppm; in the interval, 1948 to 1956, the TWA was 35 ppm, from 1957 to 1962, it was 25 ppm, from 1963 to 1968, it was 25 ppm, and from 1969 to 1975, it was 10 ppm. Certainly the exposure of workers has been steadily decreasing and it is well-documented in the study of Scott.⁵⁸ Of 38,000 data points, 87% represented exposure to 1.0 ppm or less and 98.4% were less than 10 ppm. It is of interest, and perhaps explains why there have been no reports of alleged benzene-induced leukemia among workers commencing initial exposure since 1977. On the other hand, further prospective and retrospective epidemiologic studies on the relationship of benzene exposure in the workplace and a possible incidence of leukemia and other cancers are clearly needed. It appears to this author that the evidence for benzene leukemogenesis in man is nearly incontrovertible. The crucial questions are as follows: (1) Is there a threshold exposure of no effect? (2) What is the dose-effect relationship? Infante and White²²⁻²⁹ and White et al⁷² have addressed these issues. Considering the interval exposure of 1952 to 1974, Infante and White³³ concluded that 42 to 125 ppm years is associated with a 3.75-fold relative risk of leukemia. These investigators and the International Agency for Research in Cancer³² adopted the one-hit linear model, which assumes no threshold and that every increment in dose of benzene is accompanied by an increment in the excess cancer risk. Inherent in the one-hit hypothesis is the assumption that there is a single, unique chemical event that is irreversible or that if this event takes place on DNA, there is no repair of the injury. Covalent binding of

benzene and its metabolites to DNA *in vitro* has been demonstrated by Rushmore et al.⁵⁹ Other adducts are repaired by known biochemical mechanisms and there is no *a priori* reason why the adducts formed by benzene metabolites cannot, in principle at least, be partly repaired. Chandler¹⁰ has addressed in more detail the undesirable nature of the one-hit model. The problem of chemical carcinogenesis, relationship to exposure dose, and concentration of DNA adducts has been carefully analyzed by Hoel et al.³¹ They point out that the relation between the applied dose and incidence of cancer is frequently nonlinear, but the tumor response is in some instances linear with the resulting concentration of DNA adducts in the target organ. The most likely explanation lies in the fact that many chemicals are noncarcinogenic in themselves, but are converted to carcinogenic metabolites. The pharmacokinetics of conversion, degradation, covalent binding of active metabolites, excision of adducts, and DNA repair will probably result in nonlinear processes producing the ultimate DNA adducts presumed to be part of the initiation of the carcinogenic process. These authors quite convincingly demonstrate that mathematical models used for low-dose extrapolation may overestimate the risk by several orders of magnitude in the presence of nonlinear pharmacokinetics. Because benzene is converted to active metabolites by oxidative enzymes, the determination of the levels of benzene that saturate DNA repair, detoxification of active metabolites, and measurement of DNA adducts in DNA of appropriate tissues are really needed before one can adopt the appropriate mathematical model for relationship between exposure to benzene and incidence of leukemia or any cancer. Irvine³⁷ clearly pointed out the need for understanding the mechanism of benzene carcinogenesis and low-dose data points or the debate will not be resolved. The assertion of Infante et al³³⁻³⁵ and White et al⁷² that exposure to benzene at 1 ppm is leukemogenic should be questioned for the reasons discussed above.

Leukemia is not the only hemopoietic disease observed in benzene-exposed workers. Tsongas⁶⁷ has reviewed occupational factors in the epidemiology of chemically induced lymphoid and hemopoietic cancers. In her discussion of benzene, she pointed out that multiple myeloma, reticulum

cell sarcoma, lymphosarcoma, and other lymphoid neoplasms have been observed in higher than expected rates. One can conclude from the accumulated human experience that workers exposed to benzene have a higher incidence of hematopoietic neoplasms. In the opinion of the author, one cannot construct a dose-effect curve from human exposures. Furthermore, one cannot exclude the possibility of a threshold of benzene exposure that is not carcinogenic. For the reasons discussed earlier, it is highly unlikely that the "one hit" model is appropriate for estimating the risk of exposure to benzene.

BENZENE METABOLISM

Busch et al⁹ have extensively reviewed the metabolism of benzene. Benzene, except at very high concentrations, has no known biological effects. At concentrations of many thousand ppm, it causes cardiotoxic and neurologic effects. With the present exposure limits, these are of no consequence.

About 40% of benzene is exhaled unchanged in the expired air. Thus 60% is converted by a series of enzymes. The first step is conversion to benzene epoxide by arylhydrocarbon hydroxylase (AHH). Spontaneously, about 23% to 50% is converted to phenol. This in turn is converted to phenyl glucuronide and excreted in the urine along with other lesser conjugates. A small fraction of phenol is converted to hydroquinol. Another small fraction is converted to benzene glycol by epoxide hydrase that in turn is converted to catechol by dehydrogenase. The major candidates for the active metabolites are benzene epoxide, hydroquinol, and catechol. Because major effects of benzene are upon the hematopoietic progenitors, the question has been asked whether bone marrow cells have the enzymes for converting benzene to the active metabolites, probably catechol and hydroxyquinone. This has been answered in the affirmative by Andrews et al⁵ and Irons et al.³⁶ Microsomal cytochrome P-450 produced phenol, catechol, hydroquinone, and P-benzoquinone. Rushmore et al⁵⁹ have reported that rabbit bone marrow mitochondria, stripped of their outer membrane, have been shown to carry out the NADPH-dependent bioactivation of radiolabeled benzene in vitro to metabolites that covalently bind to mitochondrial DNA, thus inhibiting transcription. Thus it

is probable that these metabolites also can covalently bind to chromosomal DNA. Kalf et al³⁸ extended the earlier studies of Rushmore et al⁵⁹ and identified several deoxyguanosine-adducts suggesting that P-benzoquinone, hydroquinone, phenol, and 1,2,4-benzenetriol form adducts with guanine.

Heidelberger²⁹ and Miller and Miller^{48,49} discuss in detail the enzymatic activation of inactive procarcinogens to chemically reactive electrophilic species. This activation is generally carried out by the nonspecific drug-metabolizing microsomal enzymes using cytochrome P-450. Epoxides are the activated metabolites of several polycyclic hydrocarbons.

Lawley⁴² has studied alkylation of DNA by several known carcinogens. Alkylation at 0 to 6 guanine is correlated with the induction of thymomata in C57B1/6 mice. Alkylation of DNA is most likely random and the probability, therefore, for mutation would depend on the extent of alkylation at various sites. Lawley believes that carcinogenesis involves specific modification of DNA of target organs and the changes associated with tumorigenesis are those associated with mutagenesis through miscoding rather than deletion of genetic material. Although one can correlate incidence of tumors with degree of adduct formation, other factors not clearly defined are required for a tumor to be expressed.

It would appear that an intensive study for presence of DNA adducts in hemopoietic tissues of mice is in order.

EFFECTS OF BENZENE UPON HEMOPOIESIS

Early studies concentrated on the effect of benzene on the peripheral blood and histology of hemopoietic tissues. For example, in 1916 Selling⁶⁰ and Weisskotten et al⁷¹ observed lymphopenia, marrow hyperplasia, and severe anemia after feeding or injecting benzene. There is an extensive literature on the effects of benzene on the peripheral blood of several species after different routes of administration and amounts of benzene. These studies are well summarized by Leong⁴⁴ and Goldstein.²⁵ Lymphopenia and its duration is a direct function of the amount of benzene administered, as is anemia and thrombopenia. Granulocytes are relatively resistant to benzene, showing a diminution only after long

exposures to large amounts of benzene. The degree of hypoplasia and its duration are also dose dependent. The preceding are effects occurring late in the hemopoietic pathway and may not be observed when subtle damage is induced in stem cells.

Bone marrow cell cycle kinetics of short-term benzene exposure have been studied by Irons et al³⁶ after injection of benzene. Flow cytometry showed a relative increase in cells in G₂ or M phase of cell cycle. In addition, there was an early increase in uptake of ³HTdR into DNA. This was followed by a decrease suggesting a defect in maturation of precursor cells. Snyder et al⁶² gave lifetime exposure of 100 and 300 ppm benzene in air six hours a day, five days a week to AKR and C57B1/6 mice. AKR mice developed anemia and lymphocytopenia. Marrow hypoplasia occurred in 20% of the benzene-exposed compared to 2% in the control mice. Thirty-three percent of C57B1/6 mice developed granulocytic marrow hyperplasia compared to none in the controls. The incidence of neoplasia will be covered later in this review. Snyder et al⁶³ also exposed rats to 100 ppm benzene in air for a lifetime. Anemia and lymphopenia were significant compared to the control sham-exposed rats. In addition, benzene-exposed rats showed marked accumulation of splenic hemosiderin compared to sham-exposed rats, suggesting hemolysis.

The preceding studies clearly indicate that benzene metabolites are damaging to bone marrow but do not provide insight into cellular sites of action in bone marrow.

Phenotypic changes in hematopoietic cells, such as biochemical and morphologic abnormalities, irrespective of cause, result from genotypic alterations in the pluripotent stem cell that perpetuates hematopoiesis or in early progenitors that have little or no self-renewal capability. In the latter case, the phenotypic changes will be fleeting and disappear as the precursor cell and its progeny divide, mature, and are removed. In studies on hematotoxicity of pollutants, one concentrates on the pluripotent hemopoietic stem cell, its rate of proliferation and differentiation into identifiable cell lines, and the mitotic potential of the immediate descendants of the pluripotent stem cell.

It is well known that the pluripotent stem cell

can only be assayed in the mouse by counting the number of gross spleen colonies formed in the fatally irradiated mouse following injection of a known number of bone marrow cells. This technique was developed by Till and McCulloch.⁶⁶ The cell colony-forming unit in the spleen is called the CFU-S. The colonies are clones arising from a single cell. After several self-renewing mitoses, the colonies commence to differentiate among the red, white, megakaryocytic, or mixed cell lines. After seven days, the colonies are easily seen by the eye on the surface of the spleen. It has been shown that although the total number of colonies seen in the spleen remains constant, colonies are disappearing apparently by differentiation after metastasis into the blood at the same rate as colonies are reappearing. These observations, made originally by Magli et al⁶⁵ and later confirmed by Priestly and Wolf,⁵³ in an elegant technique of transparent chambers in which the spleen is visualized, introduced new notions into the interpretation of spleen colonies.

The hematologic phenotypic alterations induced by benzene have been reviewed by Laskin and Goldstein⁴¹ and Snyder and Kocsis.⁶¹ They indicate injury to the self-renewing CFU-S that is transmitted to the identifiable progeny. The injury may be manifested by a permanent change in genotype, in which case the phenotypic expression will be permanent. Disappearance of the phenotypic expression is indicative of either repair of the genotypic injury by processes yet to be identified or dying out of the affected clone of stem cells.

Uyeki et al⁶⁸ exposed mice eight hours a day to 4,680 ppm benzene for one-, three-, and eight-hour sessions and then measured the cellularity, CFU-S, and colony-forming units in culture (GM-CFU-C) of bone marrow. GM-CFU-Cs are the progenitor cells for granulocytes and macrophages. They are detectable by their ability to form macroscopic colonies of granulocytes and/or macrophages in agar culture.⁴⁷ One eight-hour exposure reduced the GM-CFU-C content of marrow to 37% of the control value the day after the exposure without any change in cellularity. The GM-CFU-C progressively increased on days 3, 4, and 7, but was still 23% below controls. Three eight-hour exposures resulted in further decreases in GM-CFU-C content of the marrow. Three eight-hour expo-

tures dropped the CFU-S content of marrow by nearly a factor of three, measured 24 hours after the last session. The concentration of benzene was much greater than in other studies and observations were made for only a few days. Gill et al²³ exposed mice to 4,000 ppm benzene six hours a day, five days a week for 6 weeks, reducing the ratio of CFU-S to marrow cells by a factor of four. The development of eight-day splenic colonies after rescue marrow transfusions of the fatally irradiated mouse was inhibited by continuous exposure to 100 ppm benzene in air, clearly demonstrating that benzene metabolites inhibit stem cell self renewal. Green et al²⁶ studied the effect of graded exposure to benzene in air upon stem cells by the spleen colony technique and upon early granulocytic-macrophage precursors by in vitro culture. Their exposure regimen used concentrations of 1.1; 9.9; 103; 306; 603; 1,276; 2,416; or 4,862 ppm six hours per day for five days. In another study, mice were given 9.6 ppm for 50 days. In a third study, mice were exposed to 302 ppm for 26 weeks. Five days⁹ exposure to 103 ppm or more induced decreases in marrow and splenic cellularity, in addition to decreases in the marrow and splenic CFU-S and GM-CFU-C. Whereas exposure to 103 ppm for five days reduced CFU-S and GM-CFU-C, exposure to 9.6 ppm for 50 days (nearly the same integral dose) had no effect.

The previous studies on stem cells and hemopoietic precursors were of relatively short duration. The ability to recover and the fraction in DNA synthesis were not examined. Cronkite et al^{13,15,16} performed studies with two-, four-, eight-, and 16-week exposures and post exposure up to 25 weeks. Benzene concentrations were 10, 25, 100, 300, and 400 ppm for 6 hours per day, five days per week. Exposure to 100 ppm or higher for 2 weeks (ten exposures) reduced marrow cellularity and the number of CFU-S in the bone marrow. The fraction of CFU-S in DNA synthesis was significantly increased; thus a smaller number of CFU-Ss were producing nearly a normal number of blood cells. The reduction in CFU-S was observed as early as two days after commencing exposure to 400 ppm and was maximal at five days, at which time a significant increase in the fraction of CFU-S in DNA synthesis was seen. A lymphopenia was observed after ten exposures to 25 ppm benzene,

a concentration only 2.5 times the permissible exposure level. When mice were exposed to 300 ppm for 2 or 4 weeks, the CFU-S had returned to normal levels by 2 weeks after exposure. When exposed for 8 weeks, there was a slow linear increase in the number of CFU-S in the marrow reaching the level of the sham-exposed 16 weeks after termination of exposure. When exposed for 16 weeks, it took 25 weeks for the CFU-S to attain the level of the sham-exposed mice. The peripheral lymphocyte count returned to the level of sham-exposed by 8 weeks after termination of exposure, irrespective of the duration of exposure. Clearly, stem cells are seriously perturbed for a long interval. Research is needed on the gene rearrangement and protooncogene activation. Does exposure to benzene produce the same genetic rearrangement and activation in all mice? If so, why don't all mice become leukemic? This will be considered later under leukemogenesis.

Recent studies by Baarson et al⁶ show a very significant decrease in the number of late erythrocytic precursors (CFU-Es) that can be cultured in mice after exposure of C57B1/6 to 10 ppm benzene in air six hours a day, five days a week for 178 days. The CFU-Es were 5% of the CFU-E in the sham-exposed mice. The burst-forming units (BFU-Es) fell to 55% of the level in the sham-exposed mice by 66 days, but were normal at 178 days. Lymphocytes were about 70% of normal at 178 days. The anemia was very modest, only about $8.2 \times 10^6 \mu\text{L}$ compared to $9.3 \times 10^6 \mu\text{L}$ or 89% of the sham exposed. If the CFU-E is an obligatory pathway to the circulating red cell and amplification is unchanged, one would expect a severe anemia of less than 1.0×10^6 red blood cells (RBCs)/ μL . One must search for an explanation for this discrepancy. The few CFU-Es may have a greater amplification through additional mitoses. If so in vivo, this might have been expressed in vitro by very large colonies that were not described. Irrespective of the explanation of the discrepancy between decreased CFU-E and peripheral red count, one cannot ignore the fact that exposure to 10 ppm, the present TWA, has a significant effect upon hemopoiesis. Baarson et al (unpublished research) have shown that consumption of 5% ethanol in drinking water enhances the effect of 10 ppm in inspired air.

Other approaches to the study of hematotoxicity in mice have been reported. Harigaya et al²⁸ have compared long-term culture of bone marrow from mice exposed to benzene compared to cultures of bone marrow from sham-exposed mice. C57B1/6 female mice were exposed to 400 ppm benzene in air for six hours a day, five days a week for nine or 11 days. We observed that cultures derived from bone marrow of benzene-exposed mice showed a progressive reduction in the number of CFU-S compared to cultures derived from bone marrow of sham-exposed mice. Different combinations of adherent cells and reinoculated cells showed that cultures containing marrow cells from benzene-exposed mice had a lower capacity to maintain stem cell proliferation than normal combinations, irrespective of whether benzene-exposed marrow was in the adherent or reinoculated cells. These data show that benzene inhalation produces stem cell injury leading to diminished self replication, and injury to cells producing adherent population, leading to poor support of normal stem cell self renewal.

Garnett et al²² studied the effect of benzene exposure upon long-term bone marrow cultures with and without addition of hydrocortisone. Adherent cell layers from mice exposed to 100 or 400 ppm for nine days were devoid of fat cells regardless of whether hydrocortisone was in the culture. These data indicate that benzene influences the behavior of marrow stromal cells in long-term bone marrow culture.

Benzene also affects B and T lymphocyte populations. Rozen et al⁵⁷ exposed mice for six hours a day for six days to 300, 100, 30, and 10 ppm benzene in air. Exposure to 10 ppm reduced the capacity of B cells to produce colonies when stimulated by lipopolysaccharide. Phytohemagglutinin (PHA)-induced blastogenesis was depressed by 31 ppm benzene in air. Thus, another study has shown an effect when mice were exposed to 10 ppm benzene in air, the current permissible TWA. Pfeifer and Irons^{52,53} studied the effect of benzene metabolites upon PHA stimulation of rat bone marrow. Hydroquinone inhibited mitogenesis. The presence of micromolar amounts of metabolite (p-benzoquinone and 1,2,4-benzenetriol) partially inhibited PHA stimulation. In earlier studies, Greenlee et al²⁷ and Rickert et al⁵⁵ showed that benzene toxicity of hemopoietic tissues is associated with the

concentration of hydroquinone and catechol, but not phenol. Whereas these studies suggest that the above benzene metabolites may be the active agents, the studies do not eliminate benzene epoxide, a short-lived precursor of the above metabolites, as being an important reactive metabolite.

Cytogenetic effects of benzene have been studied. Tice et al⁶⁵ exposed mice to 3,100 ppm benzene in air for four hours and induced a significant increase in sister chromatid exchanges in bone marrow and inhibited cell proliferation. Pretreatment with phenobarbital, an inducer of P-450 cytochrome oxidases, increased the effect on sister chromatid exchanges and cell proliferation and induced chromatid-type chromosomal aberration. Gad-El-Karim et al²⁰ found that benzene induces an increase in micronuclei of polychromatic normoblasts. The effect was increased by inducers of P-448 monooxidase but not by phenobarbital, an inducer of P-450.

LEUKEMOGENESIS

Cronkite¹² in 1961 before discovery of protooncogenes believed that any agent that produced marrow aplasia would be leukemogenic. With more sophisticated knowledge on carcinogenesis, there is a growing body of evidence that indicates leukemogenesis is a multistep, complex process. There are several types of leukemia that in turn suggest that there are different molecular mechanisms involved or that the same molecular mechanisms are induced in different cell lines or at different stages of differentiation in a given cell line. There is extensive evidence for the role of key genes in carcinogenesis by Bishop,⁷ Heldin and Westermark,³⁰ Cooper and Lane,¹¹ Klein and Klein,³⁹ and Land et al.⁴⁰ The notion of carcinogenesis being a multistep process is not new. Burch⁸ deduced this on the basis of a mathematical analysis of radiation-induced cancer.

Whereas there is overwhelming evidence implicating the activation of protooncogenes to active oncogenes with production of the oncogenic proteins that in some instances are homologous with growth factors, the multiplicity of the genes, their products (protein kinases), receptors, and interactions, present a very complicated picture that is not as yet unraveled. Leukemogenesis is clearly a multistep process involving,

among other factors, a random production of DNA adducts. The heterogeneity of abnormalities is well-reviewed by Francis.¹⁹ She presents a hypothetical mechanism for induction of myeloid leukemia in man involving activation of the tyrosine kinase group of oncogenes, impaired differentiation, and imparts a role to DNA topoisomerase, the DNA untwisting enzyme. Inhibition of DNA topoisomerase freezes cells in the cell cycle, but does not kill them and appears to be involved in induction of sister chromatid exchanges. This enzyme is involved in DNA repair and defective function may result in defective repair. Whereas one cannot yet piece together all of the sequential steps required to initiate and produce a leukemia, it is clear that animal models for induction of leukemia to be described next are available for intensive study of molecular changes in DNA during leukemogenesis. Farber¹⁸ describes the cellular sequence of events in carcinogenesis that may be helpful in designing experiments on the murine models to be described.

Exposure of mice to inhaled benzene has contributed substantially to our practical knowledge on exposure conditions that are leukemogenic in different strains of mice. Stoner et al⁶⁴ exposed hairless mice to benzene throughout their whole life. The incidence of leukemia was not increased. In fact, an interpretation of their data suggests that exposure to benzene by inhalation may have suppressed the development of leukemia. Snyder et al⁶² exposed C57B1/6 and AKR mice to 300 ppm 67 hours a day, five days a week for a lifetime. There was a significant increase in the incidence of leukemia/lymphoma. In studies on rats exposed to 100 ppm for a lifetime, a single case of chronic myelogenous leukemia, a rarity in the rat, was observed by Goldstein et al.²⁴ Further studies by Snyder et al⁶³ showed severe hematotoxicity of inhaling 100 ppm benzene in air, but no significant increase in hemopoietic neoplasms. Again, rare neoplasms of the rat were seen, suggesting a neoplastic effect.

Maltoni et al,⁴⁶ summarizing many years of investigation, have produced strong evidence that benzene by injection and ingestion produces an excess number of different tumors in the rat. They emphasize the need for dose-effect studies to establish the relationship between exposure and neoplastic incidence.

Cronkite et al^{13-15,16} approached the problem of benzene leukemogenesis using C57B1/6 male mice known to harbor the radiation leukemia virus that is activated by exposure to ionizing radiation and the CBA/Ca male mouse, which has a very low spontaneous incidence of acute myeloblastic leukemia (AML) and has been shown by Major and Mole⁵⁰ to develop a high incidence of AML after exposure to ionizing radiation. The exposure regimen was based on the apparent exposure conditions of human beings described by Aksoy et al¹⁻⁴ and Vigliani and Saita.⁷⁰ Human beings do not commence work in industry until 18 years or older. Thus, exposure of mice was commenced at 12 to 14 weeks of age, when they are sexually mature. It was assumed that human beings were exposed for about 15% of their lives and, accordingly, mice were exposed for 16 weeks, approximately 15% of their lifespan. The work week was mimicked by exposing mice six hours a day, five days a week. When C57B1/6 female mice were exposed to 300 ppm benzene and held for lifetime study, a highly significant earlier onset of thymic lymphomata, nonthymic lymphoma, and leukemia was observed. Male C57B1/6 had a more rapid onset of hemopoietic neoplasms. In both sexes, the ultimate lifetime incidence was nearly the same (unpublished data). When CBA/Ca male mice were exposed to 300 ppm for 16 weeks, a striking difference between the benzene-exposed and the sham-exposed mice was seen. AML commenced appearance at about 210 days of age or 2 weeks after termination of exposure. At 600 days of age, the incidence of AML was 28% and increasing with no AML in the sham-exposed mice. When female CBA/Ca mice were exposed to 300 ppm or 100 ppm for 16 weeks, a highly significant increase in neoplasms was observed, particularly mammary adenocarcinoma. These studies are not as yet complete. The shape of the incidence curves suggests that the ultimate incidence of acute leukemia may approach 50% compared to less than 5% in the sham-exposed mice. The time sequence for appearance of acute leukemia is established. It appears that the CBA/Ca male mouse is an appropriate animal in which one could determine the abundance of DNA adducts in hemopoietic tissues with time and identify the activation of protooncogenes to provide better insight into the

mechanism of benzene leukemogenesis. In parallel, one could determine if the incidence versus benzene exposure has a similar dose-effect relationship to DNA adducts. If both have the same mathematical relationship, one would have a reasonable experimental basis for interpretation of low-dose exposure of man.

CONCLUSIONS

Our conclusions are as follows: (1) Benzene is leukemogenic in man and mice, (2) the dose-effect relationships have not been established in

man or mouse, (3) there are adequate reasons to question the "one hit" model for prediction of low-dose effects of inhalation of benzene, (4) benzene metabolites produce many toxic effects upon hemopoiesis that are dose dependent, (5) benzene inhalation of 10 ppm has been shown to produce effects on early erythrocytic precursors. The magnitude of the effect is not compatible with the slight anemia, and (6) the presence of hemopoietic effects after exposure to 10 ppm benzene in air requires further investigation and consideration of whether the present TWA of 10 ppm is justified in the workplace.

REFERENCES

1. Aksoy M, Dincal H, Akgun T, et al: Hematological effects of chronic benzene poisoning in 217 workers. *Br J Ind Med* 28:296-302, 1971
2. Aksoy M, Erdem S, Dincal G: Leukemia in shoe workers exposed chronically to benzene. *Blood* 44:837-841, 1974
3. Aksoy M, Erdem S, Dincal G: Types of leukemia in chronic benzene poisoning. *Acta Hematol* 55:65-72, 1976
4. Aksoy M: Malignancies due to occupational exposure to benzene. *Am J Ind Med* 7:395-402, 1985
5. Andrews LS, Lee EW, Witmar SM, et al: Effects of toluene on the metabolism, disposition and hemopoietic toxicity of (H^3) benzene. *Biochem Pharmacol* 26:293-300, 1977
6. Baarson KA, Snyder CA, Albert RE: Repeated exposure to C57B1/mice to inhaled benzene at 10 ppm markedly depressed erythropoietic colony formation. *Toxicol Lett* 20:337-342, 1984
7. Bishop JM: Viral oncogenes. *Cell* 42:23-38, 1985
8. Burch PRJ: Radiation and carcinogenesis: A new hypothesis. *Nature* 185:135-142, 1960
9. Rusch GM, Leong BKJ, Laskin S: Benzene metabolism, in Laskin S, Goldstein B (eds): *Benzene Toxicity*. New York, McGraw-Hill, 1977, pp 23-36
10. Chandler JLR: Benzene and one-hit model. *Risk Analysis* 4:7-8, 1984
11. Cooper GM, Lane MA: Cellular transforming genes and oncogenesis. *Biochim Biophys Acta* 738:9-20, 1984
12. Cronkite EP: Evidence for radiation and chemicals as leukemogenic agents. *Arch Environ Health* 3:297-303, 1961
13. Cronkite EP, Inoue T, Carsten AL, et al: Effects of benzene inhalation on murine hematopoietic stem cells. *J Toxicol Environ Health* 9:411-421, 1982
14. Cronkite EP, Bullis JE, Inoue T, et al: Benzene inhalation produces leukemia in mice. *Toxicol Appl Pharmacol* 75:358-361, 1984
15. Cronkite EP, Dreg RT, Inoue T, et al: Benzene hematotoxicity and leukemogenesis. *Am J Ind Med* 7:447-456, 1985
16. Cronkite EP: Benzene hematotoxicity and leukemogenesis. *Blood Cells*, 1986 (in press)
17. DeLore P, Borgomano C: Leukemia aigue au cours de l'intoxication benzenique, sur l'origine toxique de certains leukemias aigues et leur relations avec les anemies graves. *J Med Lyon* 9:227-233, 1928
18. Farber E: Chemical carcinogenesis: A current biological perspective. *Carcinogenesis* 5:1-5, 1984
19. Francis GE: Leukemogenesis: A postulated mechanism involving tyrosine protein kinase and DNA topoisomerase. *Med Hypotheses* 1986 (in press)
20. Gad-El-Karim MM, Ramanujam S, Ahmed AE, et al: Benzene myeloclastogenicity: A function of its metabolism. *Am J Ind Med* 7:475-484, 1985
21. Gaffey WR: The methodology of risk assessment. *Risk Analysis* 4:5, 1984
22. Garnett HM, Cronkite EP, Drew RT: Effect of in vivo exposure to benzene on the characteristics of bone marrow adherent cells. *Leuk Res* 7:803-810, 1983
23. Gill DP, Jenkins VK, Kempen RE, et al: The importance of pluripotential stem cells in benzene toxicity. *Toxicology* 16:163-171, 1980
24. Goldstein BD, Snyder CA, Laskin S, et al: Myelogenous leukemia in rodents inhaling benzene. *Toxicol Lett* 13:169-173, 1982
25. Goldstein BD: Hematoxicity in humans, in Laskin S, Goldstein B (eds): *Benzene Toxicity*. New York, McGraw-Hill, 1977, pp 69-106
26. Green JD, Snyder CA, LoBere J, et al: Acute and chronic dose response effects of inhaled benzene on multipotential hematopoietic stem cells (CFU-S) and granulocyte/macrophage progenitors (BM-CFU-C) cells in CD-1 mice. *Toxicol Appl Pharmacol* 58:492-503, 1981
27. Greenlee WF, Gross EA, Irons RD: Relationship between benzene toxicity and the disposition of ^{14}C -labeled benzene metabolites in the rat. *Chem Biol Interact* 33:285, 1981
28. Harigaya K, Miller ME, Cronkite EP, et al: The detection of in vivo hematotoxicity of benzene by in vitro liquid bone marrow cultures. *Toxicol Appl Pharmacol* 60:346-353, 1981
29. Heidelberger C: Current trends in chemical carcinogenesis. *Fed Proc* 32:2154-2166, 1973
30. Heldin CH, Westermark B: Growth factors: Mechanism of action and relation to oncogenes. *Cell* 37:9-20, 1984
31. Hoel DG, Kaplan NL, Anderson MW: Implication of

- nonlinear kinetics on risk estimation in carcinogenesis. *Science* 219:1032-1037, 1983
32. International Association for Research on Cancer (IARC): Monographs on the Evaluation of the Carcinogenic Risk of Chemicals to Humans. Some Industrial Chemicals and Dyestuffs, vol 29. Lyon, France, IARC, WHO, 1982
 33. Infante PE, White MC: Benzene: Epidemiologic observations of leukemia by cell type and adverse health effects associated with lower-level exposure. *Environ Health Perspect* 52:75-82, 1983
 34. Infante PF, White MC, Chu KC: Assessment of leukemia mortality associated with occupational exposure to benzene. *Risk Analysis* 4:9-13, 1984
 35. Infante PF, White MC: Projection of leukemia risk associated with occupational exposure to benzene. *Am J Ind Med* 7:403-413, 1985
 36. Irons RD, Hack Hd'A, Moore RJ, et al: Effects of short-term benzene administration on bone marrow cell cycle kinetics in the rat. *Toxicol Appl Pharmacol* 51:399-409, 1979
 37. Irvine D: Benzene. *Risk Analysis* 4:3-4, 1984
 38. Kalf GF, Snyder R, Rushmore TH: Inhibition of RNA synthesis by benzene metabolites and their co-valent binding to DNA in rabbit bone marrow mitochondria in vitro. *Am J Ind Med* 7:485-492, 1985
 39. Klein G, Klein E: Oncogene activation and tumor progression. *Carcinogenesis* 5:429-435, 1984
 40. Land H, Parada L, Weinberg RA: Cellular oncogenes and multistep carcinogenesis. *Science* 222:771-778, 1983
 41. Laskin S, Goldstein B: Benzene Toxicity. New York, McGraw-Hill, 1977
 42. Lawley PD: DNA as a target of alkylating carcinogens. *Br Med Bull* 36:19-24, 1980
 43. Le Noir C: Sur un cas de purpura attribuee a l'intoxication par le benzene. *Bull Mem Soc Med Hop Paris* 14:1251, 1897
 44. Leong DKJ: Experimental benzene intoxication, in Laskin S Goldstein B (eds): Benzene Toxicity. New York, McGraw-Hill, 1977 pp 45-62
 45. Magli MC, Iscove NN, Odartchenko N: Transient nature of early hemopoietic spleen colonies. *Nature* 295:527-529, 1982
 46. Maltoni C, Conti B, Cotti G: Benzene—a multipotential carcinogen. Results of long-term bioassays performed at the Bologna Institute of Oncology. *Am J. Ind Med* 4:589-630, 1983
 47. Metcalf D: Hemopoietic colonies. In vitro cloning of normal and leukemic cells, in Rentchnick P (ed): Recent Advances in Cancer Research 61. New York, Springer-Verlag, 1977, pp 58-70
 48. Miller JA, Miller EC: The metabolic activation of chemical carcinogens to reactive electrophils, in Yuhas JM, Tennant RW, Regan JD, (eds): Biology of Radiation Carcinogenesis. New York, Raven, 1979
 49. Miller EC, Miller JA: Milestones in chemical carcinogenesis. *Semin Oncol* 6:445-460, 1979
 50. Major IR, Mole RH: Myeloid leukemia in CBA mice. *Nature* 272:455-456, 1978
 51. Ott MG, Townsend JC, Fishbeck WA, et al: Mortality among individuals exposed to benzene. *Arch Environ Health* 33, 3-10, 1978
 52. Pfeifer RW, Irons RD: Inhibition of lectin-stimulated lymphocyte agglutination and mitogenesis by hydroquinone. Reactivity with intracellular sulfhydryl compounds. *Toxicologist* 1:106, 1981
 53. Pfeifer RW, Irons RD: Effect of benzene metabolites on PHA stimulated lymphopoiesis in rat bone marrow. *J Reticuloendothel Soc* 31:155-170, 1982
 - 53a. Priestley GV, Wolf NS: A technique for daily examination of spleen colonies in mice. *Exp Hematol* 13:733-736, 1985
 54. Rinsky RA, Young RJ, Smith AB: Leukemia in benzene workers. *Am J Ind Med* 2:217-245, 1981
 55. Richert DE, Baker TS, Bus JS, et al: Benzene disposition in the rat after exposure by inhalation. *Toxicol Appl Pharmacol* 49:417, 1981
 56. Rinsky RA, Young RJ, Smith AB: Leukemia in benzene workers. *Am J Ind Med* 2:217-245, 1981
 57. Rozen MG, Snyder CA, Albert RE: Depressions in B and T lymphocyte mitogen-induced blastogenesis in mice exposed to low concentrations of benzene. *Toxicol Lett* 20:343-349, 1984
 58. Runion HE, Scott LM: Benzene exposure in the U.S. 1978-1983. *Am J Ind Med* 7:385-398, 1985
 59. Rushmore T, Snyder R, Kalf G: Covalent binding of benzene and its metabolites to DNA in rabbit bone marrow mitochondria in vitro. *Chem Biol Interactions* 49:133-154, 1984
 60. Selling L: Benzol as a leukotoxin. Studies on degeneration and regeneration of blood and hematopoietic organs. *Johns Hopkins Hospital Rep* 17:83-142, 1916
 61. Snyder R, Kocsis JJ: Current concepts of chronic benzene toxicity. *CRC Crit Rev Toxicol* 3:265-268, 1975
 62. Snyder CA, Goldstein BD, Sellakumar AR, et al: The inhalation toxicology of benzene. Incidence of hematopoietic neoplasms and hematotoxicity in AKR/J and C57B1/6J mice. *Toxicol Appl Pharmacol* 54:323-331, 1980
 63. Snyder CA, Goldstein BD, Sellakumar AR: Evidence for hematotoxicity and tumorigenesis in rats exposed to 1009 ppm benzene. *Am J Ind Med* 5:429-434, 1984
 64. Stoner RD, Drew RT, Bernstein DM: Benzene inhalation effects upon tetanus antitoxic responses and leukemogenesis in mice in Proceedings of the 20th Hanford Life Sciences Symposium on Coal Conversion and the Environment. Oak Ridge, TN, Technical Information Center, 1980, pp 451-461
 65. Tice RR, Costa DL, Drew RT: Cytogenetic effects of inhaled benzene in murine bone marrow. Induction of sister chromatid exchanges, chromosomal aberrations, and cellular proliferation inhibition in DBA/2 mice. *Proc Natl Acad Sci USA* 77:2148-2152, 1980
 66. Till JE, McCulloch EA: A direct measurement of radiation sensitivity of normal mouse bone marrow cells. *Radiat Res* 14:213-222, 1961
 67. Tsongas TA: Occupational factors in the epidemiology of chemically induced lymphoid and hemopoietic cancers in Irons R (ed): Toxicology of the Blood and Bone Marrow. New York, Raven, 1985
 68. Uyeki EM, Ashkar AE, Shoeman DW, et al: Acute toxicity of benzene inhalation in hemopoietic precursor cells. *Toxicol Appl Pharmacol* 40:49-57, 1977

69. Van Raalte HGS, Grasso P, Irvine D: Tackling a very difficult problem. Risk Analysis 4:1-2, 1984

70. Vigliani EC, Saita G: Benzene and leukemia. N Engl J Med 271:872-876, 1964

71. Weisskotten HG, Schwartz SC, Steinsland HS: The

action of benzol on blood and blood forming tissues. J Med Res 35:63-79, 1916

72. White MC, Infante PF, Chu KE: A quantitative estimate of leukemia mortality associated with occupational exposure to benzene. Risk Analysis 2:195-204, 1982