

Rehe MS5
Px 99

May 26, 1933

Dr. Philip Drinker,
The Journal of Industrial Hygiene,
55 Van Dyke St.,
Boston, Mass.

Dear Doctor Drinker:-

I thank you for your letter of May 23rd. I understand your position, and in so far as I am able to do so I am glad to comply with your feeling and that of your associates in the matter of my criticisms of Fairhall's methods. The difficulty, as I have indicated in the appended pages, resides in the fact that Fairhall has not been specific as to the details of his procedure and I have been unable, therefore, to compare methods side by side. Thus I have been compelled to test our methods step by step, to ascertain their accuracy, and to employ the results only as the basis of comparison. I believe, from the data alone, I am justified in concluding that Fairhall's method is relatively inaccurate, since our results have been verified by different methods elsewhere. I should not hesitate, therefore, to allow him to make any reply to my criticisms that may occur to him. On the other hand I do not wish to argue the point with you, and I do not wish to place the onus of a controversy on your doorstep. I hate arguments and polemics and I should be glad to avoid them. Therefore I am sending you a modified and augmented page 14 for the 2nd paper, which if satisfactory to you can be substituted for the one now in your hands. If you prefer the original I am willing to have it stand as it is, subject to reply by Dr. Fairhall.

In the matter of the time of publication, I should be pleased to defray the additional expense involved in the publication of the papers in the same issue if the cost is not prohibitive. They are so closely related that it would be a great advantage to have them appear at the same time. If you will give me an approximate idea of the expense I shall give you a prompt reply. By that time I hope to have the sixth paper of the series completed.

Cordially yours,

Robert A. Kehoe

The Journal of Industrial Hygiene

Published by the
HARVARD SCHOOL OF PUBLIC HEALTH

Editor for the United States
DAVID L. EDSALL, M.D.

Editor for Great Britain
E. L. COLLIS, M.D.

Editorial and Business Offices
55 Van Dyke Street
Boston, Mass.

Managing Editors
CECIL K. DRINKER, M.D.
PHILIP DRINKER
MARION C. SHORLEY

May 23, 1933.

Dr. Robert A. Kehoe,
University of Cincinnati,
Laboratory of Applied Physiology,
College of Medicine, General Hospital.
Cincinnati, Ohio.

Dear Dr. Kehoe:

You may have misunderstood my recent letters about publishing your series of papers and we are anxious to remove any doubt which you may have. It is no concern of our Journal if you find different quantities of lead in excreta from the figures of Aub and Fairhall or anyone else. Providing you give your data, as you have done, we should simply publish them without comment. However, you make clear that you consider the data from Fairhall and Aub wrong because of incorrect analytical technique.

For our purposes it is unnecessary to await a settlement of your differences with Fairhall but our editors cannot see from your data justification for your sentences such as paper #2, p. 14, lines 2-15. Our Journal, like most others, will publish such statements only if accompanied by a reply from the person or persons whose work is criticised. The reply -- if a reply is needed in this case -- would be sent to you prior to sending your paper to press, and in the Journal would follow immediately after your paper (#2).

If your analytical procedure is better than Fairhall's that again is not our business but if you state as definitely as you do that his method is faulty, we request that you justify your claim, showing precisely why your method is better and where his is wrong -- in which event there would be no occasion presumably for putting in a reply from Fairhall.

Please understand that there has been no delay in sending your papers to press. However, if you want them run sooner than the September and November issues, we will run them all in September if you pay the costs of printing Nos. 3, 4, and 5. This is an arrangement we are offering all contributors from now on. Papers are accepted in the usual way, but if the author wants earlier publication than our schedule permits, he pays the printing costs and that issue is somewhat enlarged.

Sincerely yours,

Philip Drinker
Philip Drinker.

PD:hl