

#18
Mancuso
9/2/83

live file

August 31, 1961



Wilhelm C. Hueper, M.D.
9307 Rockville Pike
Bethesda 14, Maryland

Dear Bill:

I enjoyed very much my visit with you and always welcome the opportunity to talk with you, although I felt quite badly about the way certain matters are developing.

During our visit, you mentioned the Braun-Truan study, and I am enclosing the evaluation I had prepared November 18, 1960 which I had used at a teaching seminar on this subject. As you will notice, this is an analysis, almost line by line of the report, and I think it would be best to have the report before you as you read my review so that you can see what I had in mind and where it applies. Let me say, you have my permission to quote any part of the evaluation of this epidemiological study. I do not think the sentences are written for direct quotation, but I am sure you can get the essence without any difficulty.

In my opinion the study does not disprove the relationship of the association between lung cancer and asbestos exposure because of certain inherent weaknesses of the study itself. This relates to the large dilution factor which exists relative to the age distribution of the cohort, 66% being in the age group of 20-44, in the insufficient period of time in which the cohort was followed in order to approximate the 20 year latent period for this age group, and finally, the limitation in the selection and manner in which the controls were used.

In addition to this, any epidemiological study which has to base a statistical interpretation on the presence or absence of one case certainly is exceedingly weak. Knowing all the limitations and problems of epidemiologic investigations, the fact that such reliance had to be placed upon one case from which they derived the conclusion that the association of lung cancer and asbestos did not exist, raises considerable doubt as to the validity of this conclusion. I am sure you get the point I am trying to make.

Personal regards.

Sincerely yours,

Thomas F. Mancuso, M.D., M.P.H.
Chief, Division of ...

Enc.