

E. LIBRARY SOURCES OF KNOWLEDGE

(1) LIBRARY SCIENCE AND METHODOLOGY

4.109 (a) Methodology

Anne Cameron Batt was called by the Plaintiffs to give evidence as to the sources of information available to an Australian librarian between 1943 and 1955 on the effects of exposure to dust containing asbestos and on the means of controlling dust in the processes of crushing and milling asbestos ore (Exhibit 366).

4.110 Miss Batt has been a qualified librarian for fifteen years. Most of her experience in that time has been in University libraries. She is currently the medical librarian of the University of Western Australia (Exhibit 366).

4.111 William George Buick is now retired. He qualified as a librarian in 1945 after commencing work at the public library of South Australia in 1940 at the age of 17 years. In 1967 he became a Fellow of the Library Association of Australia. Mr Buick's career as a librarian took him overseas for further study. He was foundation librarian at both the University of Papua New Guinea and Murdoch University. He retired from the latter institution in 1984 due to ill health.

4.112 Mr Buick confirmed that Miss Batt's description of library science and methodology was accurate for the period 1943-1955 (Exhibit 369).

4.113 In addition he gave evidence that when employed by the Adelaide Chemical and Fertilising Company Limited in 1946 he used the methodology described to research a particular topic (T4913-4914).



(b) Indexes

4.114 On receipt of an inquiry the librarian if necessary refers to things like encyclopaedias and dictionaries in order to ascertain what the state of knowledge is on the subject and what the likely vocabulary is going to be. So that the right headings in the indexes are checked (T4834) (Exhibit 367 Appendix 9, Exhibit 369).

4.115 The librarian then checks indexes for references on the topic. The indexes available during the period 1943-1955 were:

- * Quarterly Cumulative Index Medicus.
- * Index-Catalogue of the library of the Surgeon General's office, United States Army 1936.
- * Biological Abstracts.
- * Bulletin of the literature of Industrial Hygiene.
- * Industrial Arts Index.
- * Engineering Index.
- * Chemical Abstracts.

(Exhibits 366, 369).

4.116 The indexes are a stepping stone to gain access to articles from which more detailed information is extracted (T5492).

(c) Use of other Libraries' holdings

4.117 For locations of indexes or texts and journals identified in the indexes as relevant, the librarian refers to other libraries or the catalogues of library holdings (Exhibit 366, 369).

4.118 It is a principle of good library practice described in 1943 that more than one library collection must be used in order to provide a comprehensive search and ultimately to find the documents identified in searching (T4835) (Exhibit 366, 369).

4.119 Mr Buick indicated that during the period if necessary CSIRO could be contacted directly for certain journals and that other libraries outside one's own state could be contacted (T4914).

4.120 If necessary particular journals could be obtained from overseas (Exhibit 366, 369) (T4835)..

(d) Catalogues of library holdings

4.121 The relevant catalogues of library holdings for the period 1943-1955 were Pitts catalogues 1930 and 1951 editions. The accuracy of Pitt's catalogues depended on the accuracy of material provided by various libraries (T5536).

4.121 Pitts catalogues were not exhaustive and included selected titles. Certain entries were rejected. Pitt's catalogues represented minimal holdings. CSR's company library was included in both the 1930 and 1951 editions (T4881 and T5536).

(2) AVAILABILITY OF SOURCES

(a) Major libraries

4.123 In New South Wales, Victoria and South Australia, access to the state and University library would have been sufficient to compile a reasonably extensive bibliography on effects of exposure to asbestos dust and means of controlling dust (Exhibit 366).

4.124 It was not until 1957 that Western Australia had the facilities to train medical students (Batt T4893) (T5520-5523). Prior to that time in this state, in addition to the state and University libraries may have been necessary to utilise the BMA library or the Public Health library to obtain a reasonably extensive bibliography of medical material.

4.125 As the evidence of Mr Buick indicated overseas material was regularly obtained by sea mail, aside from the war years when the material was obtained but not on a regular basis (T4917). The New South Wales branch of the British Medical Association library catalogue of 1950 also indicates extensive holdings of overseas publications (Exhibit 648).

4.126 (b) Indexes

In appendix 10A attached to her report (Exhibit 567) Miss Batt charts library holdings as listed in Pitt for the indexes she has referred to.

4.127 (i) In New South Wales

All indexes are listed as being held in at least one library prior to 1951 with the majority held in four or five libraries. After 1951 all indexes are listed as held in at least four libraries. CSR is listed as holding chemical abstracts from 1930 onwards. This is consistent with the evidence of Sir James Vernon (T6070) T6506).

4.128 This chart does not indicate that CSR held the Industrial Arts Index but Sir James thought that the library may have subscribed to it (T6070). This is consistent with the evidence that Pitts' lists of holdings were incomplete. (See para 122 above).

4.129 (ii) In Victoria

All indexes are listed as being held in at least one library prior to 1951 with the majority held in two libraries. After 1951 all indexes are listed as held in at least two libraries with the majority being held in more than four libraries.

4.130 (iii) In Western Australia

Biological Abstracts are held at the BMA library in 1930 but not in 1951. Engineering Index is held at the University library after 1951 and Chemical Abstracts is held at both the University library and the State library after 1951. Dr King indicated that the Western Australia Health Department library contained Index Medicus but was not specific as to the date (T8634).

4.131 (iv) In South Australia

All indexes except Bulletin of Hygiene are held at at least one library prior to 1951 and all indexes are held in at least one library in the state after 1951. This is consistent with the evidence of Mr Buick who was unable to recall using the Bulletin of Hygiene or the Abstract of the Literature of Industrial Hygiene (Exhibit 369).

4.132 (v) In other states

Throughout the period Queensland appears to have at least one library holding most of the indexes except for the Engineering Index and Industrial Arts index. In ACT library holdings are not listed until 1951 and again Engineering Index and Industrial Arts Index are absent. Tasmanian library holdings are not charted.

(b) Journals and Texts

4.133 Only those journals and texts referred to in evidence in chief by the Plaintiffs witnesses are charted according to Pitts catalogues in Exhibit 367 (Appendices 12A-D).

For Exhibit 162 Archives of Industrial Hygiene (1952): Two copies are noted as held in each of New South Wales, Victoria, Western Australia and Australian Capital Territory.

For Exhibit 168 Mortality from Lung Cancer 1955: Three copies are noted as held in New South Wales and one copy each in Victoria, Western Australia and South Australia.

4.136 In relation to Industrial literature by way of example:-

For Exhibit 121 Hoffman 1918: Four copies are noted as held in New South Wales, one copy in Victoria and two copies in each of South Australia and Western Australia.

For Exhibit 145 Dreessen 1918: Two copies are noted as held in New South Wales, and one copy in each of Victoria, Western Australia, South Australia and Australian Capital Territory.

For Exhibit 153 Heating and Ventilating 1944: One copy is noted in New South Wales, four copies in Victoria and one copy in South Australia and Australian Capital Territory.

4.137 (ii) Basden exhibits

Of the monographs referred to in the evidence in chief of Kenneth Basden (exhibit 189) all were recorded as being held in Australia. In most cases multiple copies were available in each state although it appears that Perry Chemical Engineers Handbook was only held in Victoria and New South Wales (Exhibit 367, appendix 12B).

4.138 (iii) Kilpatrick exhibits

Of the documents referred to in the evidence of David Kilpatrick exhibits 209-222 and 224-226 all were recorded as being held in Australia. In most cases each state holds more than one copy although Exhibit 222 Cook Industrial Medicine 1942 was only held in New South Wales and Western Australia. Whilst the Medical Journal of Australia containing extracts of the 1950 ILO conference was widely held the actual 1950 Pneumoconiosis Conference papers were only held in New South Wales and Western Australia (Exhibit 367 appendix 12C).

4.139 (iv) Musk exhibits

Of the articles referred to in the evidence in chief of Dr William Musk (Exhibits 259-161) all were recorded as multiple holdings in each state except Western Australia (Exhibit 367 appendix 12D).

(c) Private libraries

4.140 Miss Batt at page 12 of her report (Exhibit 366) refers to the private holdings of medical practitioners.

4.141 Dr Minty gave evidence that during the period he would expect the British Journal of Radiology, the American Journal of Roentgenology, the Journal of the American Cancer Society to be held by private specialist medical practitioners. In addition he believed his father subscribed to the Lancet (T4451).

4.142 In addition Dr Joseph gave evidence that Tubercle would have been subscribed to by physicians with a special interest in chest diseases (T4504).

(d) Health Department Libraries

4.143 Dr Gandevia gave evidence that an employer seeking medical guidance in relation to hazards of asbestos exposure would be most likely to find potential sources of informed opinion in the state Departments of Health. He indicated that the Health Department would have had access to the literature (T7987).

4.144 Dr Elphick confirmed this evidence specifically in relation to the Western Australia Public Health Department (T8889). The Department maintained a library between 1947 and 1955 (Elphick T8588). Dr John Woolcott became the librarian soon after 1949, in perhaps 1951 (Elphick T8589). In addition to providing lists of recent acquisitions and journals to Woolooroo (Elphick T8589) he would research material on request (King T8634).

4.145 Dr King indicated that in addition to the Public Health Department library, the Perth Chest Clinic with access to commonwealth funds, itself established a good reference library (King T8634).

(e) CSR technical library

4.146 Sir James Vernon gave evidence that the facilities of the CSR Technical library were available to all the arms of the company's operations (T6066a).

4.147 He said that the library had facilities for the conduct of research into a particular topic (T6093a-6094) and that it provided information for members of the CSR organisation and refineries and to subsidiary companies (T6071).

4.148 The CSR librarians at the time were Mr B B Levick and Mr H J D Mears (T6509 and Exhibit 365). They appear to have been members of the Australian Library Institute in 1946 (Exhibit 365).

4.149 Mr Brown gave evidence that he particularly asked that articles on asbestos he brought to his attention from late 1943 or early 1944 (T7321 and 7337).

He agreed that the library in researching medical matters was directed to abstracts from professional editors of the day, it was not a medical library (T7689).

Mr King referred to the CSR library as a very wide-ranging technical library. It circulated on a regular number of publications. From time to time the library was asked to search for particular information so the library was a quite widely used resource (T9144).

4.150 Both Sir James Vernon (T6070) and Mr Brown (T7678) confirm the library took Chemical Abstracts. Sir James Vernon thought he recalled the library used the Industrial Arts index (T6070).

4.151 Mr Brown recalled seeing copies of Heating and Ventilating (T7678) and confirmed that the CSR library held copies of the Chief Inspector of Factories Annual report (T7674). Whilst these holdings are not necessarily reflected in Pitt's catalogues, this evidence is consistent with the evidence that Pitt excluded certain company library holdings.

4.152 Pitt does indicate that CSR library held "Dust is Dangerous" Davies C W 1954 (Exhibit 367 appendix 12B). In the absence of evidence as to the actual holdings of the CSR library (called for by the Plaintiffs and not produced) (T4878) no evidence has been adduced that Pitt's catalogue reference was incorrect.