

FILE NAME: Garlock (GAR)

DATE: 1997 Jan 21

DOC#: GAR012

DOCUMENT DESCRIPTION: Barry Castleman Notes



Barry Castleman, Sc.D. environmental consultant

January 21, 1997

Barry Julian and Melissa Chapman

Garlock

Dear Barry and Melissa,

I have now spent slightly over 5 hrs looking over Garlock documents and have a little to add to what I have already provided you.

ATI Minutes of 10/9/69 contain an important sentence, reflecting the ATI's easy access to US Public Health Service official Lewis Cralley, who periodically was in attendance at ATI meetings:

"Confidential Information" on USPHS draft position paper on asbestos, reviewed by Sheckler of J-M...
"USPHS gives opinion that asbestos hazard can be controlled except for mesothelioma."

A. Kuzmuk of Garlock was recorded as present at the meeting summarized by these minutes.

The other thing I would add to what I had listed for you earlier is (G-7381) the worker's compensation claim file of Grace Baylord, hired by Garlock (NY) in 1941 and dead from asbestosis in 1958.

Shep Hoffman's exhibit G-1 is the ATI meeting in 1973 where Swetonic gave his "good news" speech, that most people (78%) in the survey were unaware that asbestos was hazardous to health (see pp 817-818 in my book). This would make a good argument for the public health need for warning labels on asbestos products. This may be among the ATI minutes that you have; if not, please call Shep for a copy.

Other tidbits: AP-5995 shows Anchor Packing started in 1908 and had 3 plants in the US and Canada by 1942; G-1410 shows Garlock was founded in 1887. So these are companies whose use of asbestos predates any publication about asbestos hazards in this country (1917). It is not believable that Anchor first learned that asbestos dust was hazardous in the 1970s. G-7378 is Kuzmuk's statement to OSHA, as representative of ATI at the 1972 OSHA asbestos standard hearings, opposing proposals to lower the permissible exposure limit (PEL) from 5 f/ml (set as emergency temporary standard on 12-7-71) to 2 f/ml (recommended by the PHS) and instead urging that the limit be raised back up to 12 f/ml, to prevent devastation and loss of jobs in the asbestos textile industry. This testimony was a factor in OSHA allowing another 4 years for industry to get down from 5 f/ml to 2 f/ml (pp 330-332 in my book). G-7389 shows consultant IHF measured exposures at Garlock in 1974-78, and a number of exposures exceeded the legal limits at the times they were measured.

I have reviewed 3 of 4 boxes of Garlock documents and 2 (of 2) boxes marked Garlock trial documents at Shep's. I can go back for a last look through the last box if you wish. All exhibit numbers are Shep's, please call him if you want copies of the documents. The 10/9/69 ATI minutes follow.

The charge for services is \$1,500.

Please let me know if there are any further questions or problems. I have not really prepared to go to trial against Garlock since sometime around 10 years back.

Sincerely,

1979 Garlock used blue asbestos yarn this year, not clear how long they had before.

1966 -- early report of Garlock graphite pump packing product (Chem Processing Feb. 1966)

1980-81 -- Garlock markets "Blue Guard" asbestos-free gaskets ("meets asbestos specs") G-5631, widely announced in trade magazines.

In 1989, EPA issued regulations calling for the end of asbestos use in "sealing products in most applications." In 1990, Garlock ran ads in **Chemical Week** (May 23, Nov. 28) boasting of the superior qualities of their asbestos-free products (e.g., "Garlock asbestos-free gasketing and packings deliver superior sealability in virtually every application.") The next year, industry challenge to the EPA rule overturned it. I called the toll-free number listed in the 1990 Garlock ad and asked if they still sell asbestos-containing gaskets, and was told they do (1/14/97).

* It would be interesting to read Garlock records planning for changeover to asbestos-free product lines in 1989-90 and then the reaction after the industry challenge to the EPA "ban" rule succeeded in 1991. What internal discussions were there about the (legal and moral) reasons to go AF versus the financial incentives to retain asbestos lines. I wonder if they knew about the approach to OMB to get packings taken out of the "ban" rule (Christmastime, 1988).

Garlock

Box 1

G-1 6/7/73 AT1 minutes & Seismic speech

AP-5995 1942 Anchor Packing brochure shows plants in Manheim PA, Elkhart IN and Montreal Que. and indicates the company started in 1908.

G-1410 Asbestos 3/71 Garlock history
Founded 1887

* G-5613 is 5/4/82 letter/memo describing the availability of "Blue Guard" asbestos free gaskets, saying both ash + AF types remain available for sale.

→ Verify they still sell Asb. and seek documents re EPA "ban" rule & aftermath.

G-5615 shows AF Blue Guard gaskets available from at least ~~1981~~ 1981

G-5622 - Garlock used blue asbestos yarn (1979 document)

G-7375 ^{10/9/}1969 AT1 (Garlock: Kuyumuk) - minutes

"asbestos hazard can be controlled
except for mesothelioma."

G-7378 A. Kuyumuk statement as ATI rep
to OSHA re proposed std. 3/13/72
asks PEL to be set back up at
12 f/ml.

G-7381 NY Workers' Comp. claim
records of Grace Baylond 1958-1959
- A's death of employee hired 1941
by Garlock, no previous asb.
exposure history

G-7389 IAH Analytical Laboratory
reports on fiber counts at
Garlock 1974-1978 contain
a number of counts that
exceeded legal limits (5 f/cc
from 1972-1976; 2 f/cc after July,
1976)

I've now reviewed the first 3 of 4
Garlock boxes and both boxes
of Garlock trial documents."

G-8432 June, 1977 Fluid Sealing Assn
memo req. mfgs' labels on
products

G-8433 7/1/76 Flexitallic letter
to W.P. Howard, T+N, re
Fluid Sealing Assn. considering
a ban on use of SFAA (blue
and ~~red~~ brown asbestos?)

G-8599 Nat. Safety News Aug. 1953
David S. Beyer "The Mechanical Control
of Occupational Diseases."
Liberty Mutual engineer
mentions asbestos hazard

higher nos. were later NSC exhibits,
nothing very striking (1940's-1960's)

G-7390 Table of fiber count data sheets
in Aug- 1972 (OSHA: 5 f/cc) > su
(since 12/7/71)

		<u>≤5</u>	<u>>5</u>	<u>>10</u>	<u>>20</u>	
1972	p1	5	6	3		
	p2	3	8	6	3	[mostly 1-h samples]
	3	1	7	5	2	
	4	0	8	5	2	
	5	2	6	6	2	
	6	0	8	3		
	7	3	5	4		
	8	2	6	3	1	
	9	0	8	6	1	
1973	10	0	8	6		
	11	1	7	6	1	
	12	0	8	5		
	13	2	10	5	2	
	14	5	7	3		
	15	3	8	4		
	16	1	11	6	3	
	17	2	10	8	3	
	18	6	6	2		
	19	6	6	3		
	20	8	3	2	1	
Subtotals		50	146	91		
		<u>196</u>				

Data Sheet
No.

<u>≤ 5 fcc</u>	<u>> 5</u>	<u>> 10</u>	<u>> 20</u>
8	10 3	2 6	4
2	10	6	4
0	12	12	6
2	10	9	8
1	11	9	6
1	11	10	8
1	11	10	5
2	8	7	2
2	3	2	
1	4		

Sept.-month w/
numbers closed

(highest 84.5)
30 min samples
high: 57, 77
30 min. samples
high: 50.7

1064

Empl. Mut.
Barack

high: 72

31	32	33	34	35	36	37	38	39	40	41	42	43	44	45																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																
----	----	----	----	----	----	----	----	----	----	----	----	----	----	----	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--

Data Sheet

No. ≤ 5 f/cc > 5 f/cc > 10 > 20

46

0

5

4

2

47

0

5

5

3

48

1

2

2

1

High
61

1/76

49

2

3

2

1

High
63

Subtotals

3

15

13

18

TOTALS

85

305

216

390 fiber counts

Observations

Slightly under $\frac{1}{4}$ of the recorded exposures were definitely within legal limits (≤ 5 f/cc longer than 5 min)

More than half of the recorded exposures violated the peak exposure limit for 15-min. periods allowed by OSHA (10 f/cc)

There seems no trend of improvement, with ratios of illegal counts: legal ones worse on pp 2-3 of the data. Also

1975 + 75

7 + 17 counts over 20 f/cc

18 + 43 counts total

$$= \frac{24}{61} = \underline{39\%} \text{ of counts over 20}$$

1972 + 1973

$$\frac{28 + 21}{196 + 71} = \frac{49}{267} = \underline{18\%} \text{ over 20}$$