

PUBLIC HEALTH ASSESSMENT

MURRAY SMELTER MURRAY, SALT LAKE COUNTY, UTAH

CONCLUSIONS

ATSDR considers the proposed Murray Smelter NPL Site to be no apparent public health hazard. This is based on finding no elevated blood lead or urine arsenic levels in an investigation of children and adults from Grandview and Doc and Dell Mobile Home Park. These results indicate that health effects due to arsenic, cadmium, and lead are unlikely due to limited exposure to these metals. This conclusion is also based on a toxicological evaluation of worker exposure situations which indicated that exposure levels were too low to result in health effects. However, if exposure circumstances changed so that the amount of exposure increased significantly, health effects would be possible. Therefore, remediation of contaminated soil should be done based on the potential for health effects as indicated by the soil levels of these metals.

There is limited potential for human exposure to site-related contaminants in groundwater, fish and sediments in Little Cottonwood Creek, and vegetables grown in area soils.

Surface water is eliminated as an exposure pathway because surface water near the site is not used as drinking water and skin absorption of dissolved metals from surface water is unlikely to be significant.

PUBLIC HEALTH ACTIONS

A major purpose of a public health assessment is the identification of the actions needed to protect public health, evaluate whether exposure is occurring or could occur, or identify whether there are site-related health effects. We have identified the following public health actions.

Completed Public Health Actions

In October 1995, the Salt Lake City/County Health Department, ASARCO, and ATSDR tested children and adults in the Grandview and Doc and Dell's mobile home parks for lead in blood and arsenic in urine.

In 1995, ASARCO removed the contaminated material from the swing set area and other adjacent areas with surface slag and potential smelter-derived materials in the Grandview Mobile Home Park.

ASARCO monitored groundwater on site to determine water quality. ATSDR recommends that the source of on-site arsenic contamination be identified and removed if feasible.



Ongoing Public Health Actions

EPA/ASARCO plans to evaluate whether further soil removals at Grandview Mobile Home Park should occur.

Recommendation to Area Residents

We recommend that people consuming homegrown produce from gardens in contaminated areas (Figures 3 and 4) use 2 feet of clean fill for their gardens.

Public Health Comment

The public health assessment was available for public review and comment in the Murray library from October 10 to November 29, 1996. The public comment period was announced in local newspapers. In addition, the public health assessment was sent to several individuals, federal, state, and local agencies, and ASARCO. Comments were received only from a consultant for ASARCO, PTI Environmental Services. Those comments and our responses are summarized in Appendix 4 beginning on page 47.

PREPARERS OF REPORT

John R. Crellin, Ph.D.
Environmental Health Scientist
Superfund Site Assessment Branch
Division of Health Assessment and Consultation

Laura Barr
Environmental Health Scientist
Superfund Site Assessment Branch
Division of Health Assessment and Consultation

ATSDR Regional Representative

Susan Muza
Regional Representative
ATSDR Region VIII

REFERENCES

1. Roy F. Weston. Baseline Risk Assessment for the Murray Smelter Superfund Site. Site-Wide Evaluation Lakewood, CO: Roy F. Weston, Inc. August 1996.
2. U.S. Environmental Protection Agency (EPA). HRS Documentation Record, Murray Smelter (Region VIII). Washington, D.C.: EPA, October 1993.

3. Hydrometrics, Inc. for ASARCO Incorporated, Engineering Evaluation/Cost Assessment Work Plan Documents for Former Murray Smelter Site, Murray, Utah, December 1994.
4. Ecology and Environment (E&E), EPA Technical Assistance Team (TAT). Memorandum from D. Kraft to S. Hawthorne, O.S.C., concerning evaluation of risk to human health at the Murray Smelter Site, December 29, 1993.
5. R.F. Weston, Inc., for EPA, Draft Final Air Dispersion Modeling of Murray Smelter Site, Murray City, Utah, EPA No. 4800-051-0001, November 1994.
6. Hydrometrics, Inc., for ASARCO Inc., Sampling and Analysis Plan for Former Murray Smelter Site, Murray, Utah, May 1995.
7. Hydrometrics, Inc., for ASARCO Inc., Soil Technical Memorandum I- Former Murray Smelter Site, Murray, Utah, Revised draft I, December 1995.
8. IHI Environmental for ASARCO Inc., Soil Removal Action Implementation, Grandview Trailer Park, December 15, 1995.
9. EPA Emergency Response Team (ERT). Field Analytical Report. Salt Lake Valley Smelter Sites. Salt Lake County, Utah. Edison, NJ: EPA ERT. Abridged Version-No Appendices.
10. Memorandum and data package from J. Fricke to M. McCeney, May 4, 1995.
11. Industrial Health Incorporated, Field Investigation, The Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-day Saints, June 29, 1994.
12. USEPA memorandum to S. Theriot from C.A. Crisler, UDEQ, February 1, 1994.
13. Ecology and Environment (E&E), EPA Technical Assistance Team (TAT). Sampling QA/QC Work Plan, Murray Smelter, EPA Project No. T08-9210-047, March 1993.
14. Ecology and Environment (E&E), EPA Technical Assistance Team (TAT). Memorandum from K. Romine to S. Hawthorne, O.S.C., concerning validated results for Murray Smelter Site, September 10, 1993.
15. Site Characterization Report, Former Murray Smelter Site, Murray, Utah,
16. PTI Environmental Services, for ASARCO Inc., Groundwater Technical Hydrometrics, Inc., for ASARCO Inc., Data Validation Reports, Former Murray Smelter Site, Murray Utah, Surface Water and Groundwater Inorganics: January, April, and July data, 1996.
17. Hydrometrics, Inc., for ASARCO Inc., Draft Off-facility Soil and House Dust Sampling and Analysis Work Plan Addendum to Engineering Evaluation/Cost Analysis Work Plan for Former Murray Smelter Site, Murray, Utah, May 1995.
18. Ecology and Environment (E&E), EPA Technical Assistance Team (TAT). Report of Sampling Activities, Murray Smelter, April 13-14, 1993, Salt Lake County, Utah, April 30, 1993.
19. Hydrometrics, Inc., for ASARCO Inc., Surface Water Technical Memorandum I, Former

Murray Smelter Site, Murray, Utah, October 1995.

20. EPA. Toxic Chemical Release Inventory. Washington, D.C.: National Library of Medicine, 1987-93.
21. EPA. Chemical Releases and Chemical Risks. A Citizen's Guide to Risk Screening. Washington, D.C.: U.S. Environmental Protection Agency (EPA). 1989.
22. ATSDR. *Public Health Assessment Guidance Manual*. Atlanta, Georgia: U.S. Department of Health and Human Services, Public Health Service, March 1992.
23. Lilienfeld AM, Lilienfeld DE. *Foundations of Epidemiology. Second Edition*. New York, NY: Oxford University Press. 1980.
24. ATSDR. *Toxicological Profile for Arsenic. Update* Atlanta, Georgia: U.S. Department of Health and Human Services, Public Health Service, TP-92/02. 1993.
25. EPA. Integrated Risk Information System (IRIS) file on Toxicology Data Network (TOXNET). Bethesda, MD: National Library of Medicine (NLM). June 1995.
26. Ruby MV, Davis A, Schoof R, Eberle S, Sellstone CM. Estimation of lead and arsenic bioavailability using a physiologically based extraction test. *Environ Sci Tech* 30: 422-430. 1996.
27. Freeman GB, Johnson JD, Killinger JM, Liao SC, Davis AO, Ruby MV, Chaney RL, Lovre SC, Bergstrom PD. Bioavailability of arsenic in soil impacted by smelter activities following oral administration in rabbits. *Fund Appl Toxicol* 21: 83-88. 1993.
28. Freeman GB, Schoof RA, Ruby MV, Davis AO, Dill JA, Liao SC, Lapin CA, Bergstrom PD. Bioavailability of arsenic in soil impacted by smelter activities following oral administration in rabbits. *Fund Appl Toxicol* 28: 215-222. 1995.
29. EPA Memorandum No.1, Murray Smelter Facility, Murray, Utah, September 1995.
30. Hydrometrics, Inc., for ASARCO, Inc., Groundwater Technical Memorandum No. 2, Former Murray Smelter Facility, Murray, Utah, December 1995.
31. Site Characterization Report, Former Murray Smelter Facility, Murray, Utah, Draft of volume 1-text and exhibits, April 1996.
32. Versar Architects & Engineers, Inc. for Monroc Inc. Preliminary Site Assessment Environmental Impacts of Slag Located at the Monroc Asphalt Plant Site at 5011 South 200 West, Salt Lake City, Utah, June 27, 1991.
33. ATSDR. *Toxicological Profile for Cadmium. Update* Atlanta, Georgia: U.S. Department of Health and Human Services, Public Health Service, TP-92/06. 1993.
34. ATSDR. *Toxicological Profile for Lead. Update*. Atlanta, Georgia: U.S. Department of Health and Human Services, Public Health Service, TP-92/12. 1993.

35. Duggan MJ, Inskip MJ. Childhood exposure to lead in surface dust and soil: a community problem. *Pub Hlth Rev* 13: 1-54, 1985.
36. Madhavan S, Rosenman KD, Shehata T. Lead in soil: recommended maximum permissible levels. *Env Res* 49: 136-142, 1989.
37. Needleman HL et al. The long-term effects of exposure to low doses of lead in childhood: an 11-year follow-up report. *NEJM* 322: 83-88, 1990.
38. ATSDR. *The Nature and Extent of Lead Poisoning in Children in the United States: a Report to Congress*. Atlanta, GA: Agency for Toxic Substances and Disease Registry (ATSDR). 1988.
39. ATSDR. *Case Studies in Environmental Medicine - Lead Toxicity*. Atlanta, GA: Agency for Toxic Substances and Disease Registry (ATSDR). June 1990.
40. SLCHD. Murray Smelter Project Report. Letter from LR Garrett (SLCHD) to JR Crellin (ATSDR) Salt Lake City-County Health Department. Salt Lake City, UT. January 29, 1996
41. Casreel SW, Brown LD, Dunsmore ME, Weis CP, Henningsen GM, Hoffman E, Brattin WJ, and Hammon TL. Bioavailability of Lead in Slag and Soil Samples from the Murray Smelter Superfund Site. University of Missouri. Columbia, MO. Prepared for U.S. EPA Region VIII. June, 1996.
42. Hill RN. Current EPA perspectives on animal selection and extrapolation. in (Roloff MV et al, eds) *Human Risk Assessment. The Role of Animal Selection and Extrapolation*. London: Taylor and Francis. 1987.
43. Stallones RA. Epidemiology and Environmental Hazards. in (Gordis L and Libauer CH, eds) *Epidemiology and Human Risk Assessment*. Oxford: Oxford University Press. 1988.
44. Paustenbach DJ. A survey of health risk assessment. in (Paustenbach DJ, ed) *The Risk Assessment of Environmental Hazards. A Textbook of Case Studies*. New York: John Wiley and Sons. 1989.

[Next Section](#) [Table of Contents](#)

