



CHEMICAL MANUFACTURERS ASSOCIATION

MEMORANDUM
June 25, 1985

TO: Environmental Management Committee

FROM: William P. Gullledge *WPG*
Alice R. Mayer *ARM*
Fredric P. Andes *FPA*

RE: CMA Participation in Vinyl Chloride Litigation

On January 9, 1985, EPA withdrew proposed revisions to the vinyl chloride emission standards under section 112 of the Clean Air Act. The Natural Resources Defense Council (NRDC) has challenged that withdrawal in the U.S. Court of Appeals for the D.C. Circuit. That litigation will be the first case to decide how stringently EPA must set emission standards under section 112 of the Clean Air Act (the "ample margin of safety" issue). The case will therefore serve a precedent governing all future section 112 standards. Since many of the chemicals used or produced by CMA members are being considered for regulation under section 112, the case will have an important effect on CMA members' plant operations. Further, CMA's interest is not being adequately represented in the case.

We therefore recommend that CMA intervene, or participate as amicus curiae, in the case in order to present its position that section 112 should be interpreted to allow EPA to use a reasonable, risk management-based regulatory approach. The leaders of the Clean Air Act Revisions and Process Emission Regulations Task Group join in this recommendation. CMA would file joint briefs with the American Petroleum Institute, to ensure industry coordination. Briefing will not involve significant resources, since the relevant legal issues have already been researched for other section 112 litigation in which CMA is involved. The necessary resources have already been factored into CMA's budget for outside counsel assistance.

The vinyl chloride litigation has moved very quickly. As a result, the case has moved ahead of the briefing schedules of two other section 112 cases which began earlier, benzene and radionuclides, both of which CMA has intervened in. Further, it has only recently become evident that CMA's participation is needed. Therefore, we need permission to file the necessary papers with the court as soon as possible -- by Friday, June 28.

SCC
4-0659

We recommend that the EMC approve this action at its June 27 meeting.

BACKGROUND

The vinyl chloride standard was originally issued on October 21, 1976. The Environmental Defense Fund (EDF) sued, alleging that the standard was too lax and did not satisfy the "ample margin of safety" test of section 112. The case was never briefed, though; EPA and EDF instead signed a settlement agreement in March 1977, which committed EPA to propose certain amendments to the standards.

On June 2, 1977, EPA proposed those amendments. The proposed changes would have made the standard significantly more stringent and set a "zero emission goal," to be achieved over time as the standard was revised in light of developing control technology. CMA filed comments objecting to the proposal.

Once EPA proposed the amendments to the standard, EDF dismissed its judicial challenge. However, EPA took no action, over the next several years, to finalize the amendments. Finally, on January 9, 1985, EPA published a notice withdrawing the proposal. EPA had decided that the original 1976 standard was both technically appropriate and legal under section 112. Therefore, the proposed changes were rejected, and the original standard reaffirmed. (EPA did, at the same time, propose some administrative changes to the current standard, but those are not relevant to the litigation.)

LITIGATION

NRDC has filed suit in the D.C. Circuit challenging the Agency's withdrawal of the 1977 proposal. NRDC contends that EPA must set standards under section 112 based completely on health risks, with no consideration of costs, benefits or technological feasibility. If the court rules in favor of this position, all section 112 standards for carcinogens would apparently have to be set at a zero emission level. Of course, such a ruling would have severe impacts on the operations of CMA members, even forcing plant shutdowns.

It therefore is important for there to be an adequate defense of EPA's current interpretation of section 112, which allows technical and economic factors to be considered in setting standards. In other similar cases, industry participation has been important to buttress the Agency's own defense and to ensure that industry's viewpoint is adequately represented. In the vinyl chloride litigation, the only industry party currently involved is

the Vinyl Institute. The Institute will focus its efforts on technical issues involving the vinyl chloride standards rather than policy issues concerning the meaning of section 112. Therefore, further industry participation is necessary. API is interested in the case and in the possibility of filing a joint brief with CMA. This brief would enunciate the same position that CMA and API plan to take in the benzene case: that section 112 permits EPA to set standards taking into account technical and economic considerations. The research on this issue has basically been completed, so the effort should not involve significant resources.

RECOMMENDATION

We and the leaders of the Clean Air Act Revisions and Process Emission Regulations Task Groups recommend that CMA petition to intervene (or, if that is not feasible, to file as amicus curiae) in the section 112 vinyl chloride litigation. The filing should be done jointly with API, and should be completed as soon as possible.

0025 15.39.00
6/24/85

X----CHEMICAL MANUFACTURERS ASSOCIATION----X
COMMITTEE MEMBER ROSTER

COMMITTEE: P161 V C PROG PAUL PHASE VIII=STACK

#	COMPANY	INDIVIDUAL NAME	BIRTH DATE	SEX	ML TY	IN TY	RGV CDE	TELE COPIER
3332	151589	E J Baier Diamond Shamrock Chems Co 717 N Harwood-Rm3243 Dallas TX 75201 214/745-2738						
110	151546	Dr. John Barr Air Products & Chemicals Inc. P. O. Box 539 Allentown PA 18105 215/481-8343						45
43546	151672	Dr Zeb G Bell Jr PPG Industries Inc-chem Div One PPG Place Pittsburgh PA 15272 412/434-3865						
5391	151598	Dr T J Benya Ethyl Corporation 451 Florida Avenue Baton Rouge LA 70801 504/388-7855						
48478	151682	S R Cowles Shell Oil Company P O Box 2463 Houston TX 77210 713/241-3974						
48794		Ronald W Frase Diversitech General One General Street Akron OH 44329 216/798-3000						
9316	151644	Dr William Gaffey Monsanto Company 800 N Lindbergh Blvd St Louis MO 63157 314/694-8811						
3045	151594	Thomas G Grumbles Vista Chemical Company P O Box 19029 Houston TX 77224 713/531-3445						
45527	151695	Mr. D. H. Hunter Tenneco Polymers, Inc. P. O. Box 2511 Houston TX 77001 713/757-8641						
5711	151611	Dr. C. A. Johnson The Goodyear Tire & Rubber Co. 1144 E Market Street Akron OH 44316 216/796-7676						
6607	151610	Mr. M. V. Johnson Md. The BFGoodrich Co.-Chem. Group 500 S. Main St.-3rd. 5H Akron OH 44318 216/374-3298						M
556	151682	Dr. Vance L. Kirkland Shell Oil Company P. O. Box 4320 Houston TX 77210 713/241-3344						

SCC
4-0662

25 15.39.00
6/24/85

X----CHEMICAL MANUFACTURERS ASSOCIATION----X
COMMITTEE MEMBER ROSTER

COMMITTEE: P161 V C PROG PAUL PHASE VIII#STACK

COMPANY	INDIVIDUAL NAME	BIRTH DATE	SEX	ML TY	IN TY	RGN CDE	TELE COPIER
41402	Mr Owen H Kittilstad Certain Teed Corporation P O Box 860 Valley Forge PA 19482 215/857-5000						
46837 151700	Mr. Benton R. Leach Corporate Dir, Hlth, Sfty Aff Uniroyal Inc. - R-1-1 World Headquarters Middlebury CT 06749 203/573-2153						
5667 151599	Dr. J. Lynch Exxon Chemical Company P. O. Box 235 E Millstone NJ 08873 201/873-6071						
42513 151660	Russell Park Occidental Chemical Corp P O Box 699 Pottstown PA 19464 215/326-2000						
45208 151690	Mr P E Roggi Stauffer Chemical Company Nyla Farms Road Westport CT 06881 203/222-4414						
129 151562	Dr E N Skiest Borden Inc - Suite 101 960 Kingsmill Pkwy Columbus OH 43229 614/225-4958						
4010 151591	Dr T R Torkelson Dow Chem U S A-Health & Envir 1803 Building Midland MI 48640 517/635-5197						M
7241 151576	Dr. C. Pang Wen Gulf Oil Products Company P.O. Box 2100 Houston TX 77252 713/754-4334						
46655 151698	Mr. R. N. Wheeler, Jr. Chemicals & Plastics Union Carbide Corporation, Inc. Box 8004 S Charleston WV 25303 304/747-2164						
42596 151660	Dr M R Zavon Occidental Chemical Corp P O Box 728 Niagara Falls NY 14302 715/286-3090						

COMMITTEE TOTAL: 22